



A National Survey of DNP's' Labor Participation, Activities and Reports of Degree Contributions

**Ann F. Minnick PhD, RN, FAAN, Ruth Kleinpell PhD, RN,
FAAN, FAANP, FCCM , Terri L. Allison DNP, ACNP-BC, FAANP**

Vanderbilt University School of Nursing, Nashville TN 37240

Learner Outcomes

- ▶ Describe data sources regarding DNP/DNAP outcomes
- ▶ Identify the educational and policy implications of findings from these sources as well as a 2017 randomized, national study of members of American Association of Nurse Anesthetists (AANA), American Organization of Nurse Executives (AONE), and American Association of Nurse Practitioners (AANP)

Acknowledgements

- ▶ Funding support for the development of REDCap platform used in our survey is: Grant Support: UL1 TR000445 from NCATS/NIH

Significance

- ▶ Program costs to students, institution and society
- ▶ Educational responsibility and others
- ▶ Potential impact on professional solidarity



Aims

- ▶ Describe DNP graduates' roles, activities and opinions about degree effects
- ▶ Explore differences between and among DNP graduates by job title and organizational membership

Current data sources: Contributions and Gaps

- ▶ Self report: satisfaction and work contributions
- ▶ Reviews of school newsletters: projects and work contributions
- ▶ Limitations
- ▶ Gaps

Results of 2017 National Study

Design & Method

- ▶ Design - Cross-sectional, IRB approved
- ▶ Method - Survey (paper or on-line REDCap option)
- ▶ Instrument – Based on AACN essentials and previously tested demographic and labor items

Subjects

- ▶ Overall response rate 32% (n=1846)
- ▶ Organizational membership
 - AANA (n=1283)
 - All DNPs
 - Response rate 35% (n=452)
 - AONE (n=2606)
 - Random
 - Response rate 26% (n=672)
 - AANP (n=2000)
 - Random DNPs
 - Response rate 37% (n=740)
 - Note: Subjects could indicate membership in >1 organization

Analytic Techniques

Characteristics of the DNP Subjects by Organization (n=1308)

(1 of 2)

| Characteristic | Membership | | | |
|---|--------------|--------------|--------------|---------------|
| | % (n) | | | |
| | AONE (n=253) | AANP (n=642) | AANA (n=427) | All (n=1308)* |
| Gender | | | | |
| Male | 14.7 (37) | 10.6 (67) | 33.9 (143) | 19.1 (246) |
| Female | 84.5 (212) | 89.2 (563) | 65.9 (278) | 80.6 (1041) |
| Don't wish to identify | 0.8 (2) | 0.2 (1) | 0.2 (1) | 0.3 (4) |
| Ethnic Background | | | | |
| Hispanic or Latino/a | 2.5 (6) | 5.0 (31) | 4.9 (20) | 4.5 (57) |
| Racial Background | | | | |
| American Indian or Alaska Native | 0.8 (2) | 1.2 (8) | 2.1 (9) | 1.4 (18) |
| Asian | 3.2 (8) | 3.7 (24) | 3.5 (15) | 3.7 (48) |
| Black or African American | 2.0 (5) | 4.5 (29) | 3.3 (14) | 3.7 (48) |
| Native Hawaiian or Other Pacific Islander | 0.0 | 0.3 (2) | 0.7 (3) | 0.5 (6) |
| White | 90.5 (229) | 87.4 (561) | 88.5 (378) | 88.0 (1151) |

Characteristics of the DNP Subjects by Organization (n=1308)

(2 of 2)

| Characteristic | Membership | | | |
|--------------------------|------------------------|--------------------|--------------------|--------------------|
| | Mean Years (SD; Range) | | | |
| | AONE | AANP | AANA | All |
| Age | 55.5 (7.4; 28-75) | 49.0 (11.1; 25-77) | 46.5 (10.6; 26-69) | 49.3 (10.7; 25-77) |
| Age at DNP Graduation | 51.9 (7.4; 28-74) | 45.0 (10.5; 24-74) | 42.6 (10.2; 24-63) | 45.4 (10.3; 24-74) |
| Years Since DNP Attained | 3.6 (2.5; ≤1-15) | 4.0 (3.0; ≤1-25) | 3.9 (2.4; 1-18) | 3.9 (2.8; ≤1-25) |

Ratings of DNP Education Impact on Abilities by Organization (1 of 2)

| Impact on Abilities | Rating (%) | | | | |
|--------------------------------|------------|------|------|------|-----------------|
| | Not at all | 2 | 3 | 4 | Profound Effect |
| <u>Organizational Change</u> | | | | | |
| All (n=1268) | 9.3 | 8.8 | 20.7 | 32.7 | 28.5 |
| AONE (n=243) | 1.2 | 1.2 | 10.7 | 43.6 | 43.2 |
| AANP (n=621) | 10.0 | 8.2 | 23.7 | 29.6 | 28.5 |
| AANA (n=419) | 12.2 | 13.6 | 22.4 | 32.0 | 19.8 |
| <u>Quality Improvement</u> | | | | | |
| All (n=1273) | 6.6 | 6.0 | 16.5 | 35.0 | 35.9 |
| AONE (n=243) | 1.2 | 2.1 | 12.3 | 38.7 | 45.7 |
| AANP (n=624) | 5.9 | 5.1 | 17.9 | 32.4 | 38.6 |
| AANA (n=420) | 9.5 | 9.0 | 16.9 | 37.6 | 26.9 |
| <u>Evidence Based Practice</u> | | | | | |
| All (n=1277) | 4.3 | 3.6 | 11.6 | 28.5 | 52.0 |
| AONE (n=245) | 0.4 | 2.0 | 8.2 | 26.9 | 62.4 |
| AANP (n=628) | 5.1 | 2.9 | 11.8 | 26.1 | 54.1 |
| AANA (n=418) | 4.3 | 5.5 | 13.4 | 34.7 | 42.1 |

Ratings of DNP Education Impact on Abilities by Organization

(2 of 2)

| Impact on Abilities | Rating (%) | | | | Profound Effect |
|-----------------------|------------|------|------|------|-----------------|
| | Not at all | 2 | 3 | 4 | |
| <u>Leadership</u> | | | | | |
| All (n=1275) | 5.7 | 4.2 | 15.4 | 33.6 | 41.1 |
| AONE (n=244) | 1.6 | 2.0 | 8.6 | 30.7 | 57.0 |
| AANP (n=628) | 5.3 | 4.3 | 16.1 | 32.0 | 42.4 |
| AANA (n=417) | 8.2 | 4.6 | 18.7 | 37.6 | 30.9 |
| <u>Policy Setting</u> | | | | | |
| All (n=1260) | 12.8 | 12.5 | 27.1 | 30.0 | 17.6 |
| AONE (n=243) | 7.0 | 7.8 | 21.8 | 39.9 | 23.5 |
| AANP (n=619) | 13.7 | 12.9 | 26.5 | 28.9 | 17.9 |
| AANA (n=413) | 13.6 | 13.8 | 31.5 | 28.1 | 13.1 |

Ratings of DNP Education Impact on Abilities by Position

(1 of 3)

| Impact on Abilities | % Rating | | | | |
|---|------------|------|------|------|-----------------|
| | Not at all | 2 | 3 | 4 | Profound Effect |
| <u>Organizational Change</u> | | | | | |
| All respondents (n=1268) | 9.3 | 8.8 | 20.7 | 32.7 | 28.5 |
| Faculty/Educational Administrator (n=211) | 4.7 | 5.7 | 16.6 | 38.4 | 34.6 |
| Administrator (n=221) | 1.4 | 0.9 | 10.9 | 40.3 | 46.6 |
| CRNA (n=329) | 14.3 | 15.8 | 23.1 | 30.1 | 16.7 |
| Nurse Practitioner (n=424) | 12.0 | 10.1 | 27.1 | 25.5 | 25.2 |
| <u>Quality Improvement</u> | | | | | |
| All respondents (n=1273) | 6.6 | 6.0 | 16.5 | 35.0 | 35.9 |
| Faculty/Educational Administrator (n=213) | 3.3 | 2.8 | 16.9 | 29.6 | 47.4 |
| Administrator (n=221) | 1.8 | 2.3 | 9.5 | 38.9 | 47.5 |
| CRNA (n=331) | 11.8 | 10.9 | 18.4 | 36.3 | 22.7 |
| Nurse Practitioner (n=426) | 7.5 | 6.8 | 18.5 | 33.8 | 33.3 |

Ratings of DNP Education Impact on Abilities by Position

(2 of 3)

| Impact on Abilities | % Rating | | | | |
|--|------------|-----|------|------|-----------------|
| | Not at all | 2 | 3 | 4 | Profound Effect |
| <u>Evidence Based Practice</u> | | | | | |
| All respondents (n=1277) | 4.3 | 3.6 | 11.6 | 28.5 | 52.0 |
| Faculty/Educational Administrator (n=212) | 3.3 | 0.5 | 9.4 | 25.9 | 60.8 |
| Administrator (n=222) | 0.9 | 2.7 | 9.0 | 26.1 | 61.3 |
| CRNA (n=331) | 5.7 | 6.3 | 15.1 | 35.6 | 37.2 |
| Nurse Practitioner (n=429) | 5.8 | 4.2 | 11.4 | 25.9 | 52.7 |

Ratings of DNP Education Impact on Abilities by Position

(3 of 3)

| Impact on Abilities | % Rating | | | | |
|---|------------|------|------|------|-----------------|
| | Not at all | 2 | 3 | 4 | Profound Effect |
| Leadership | | | | | |
| All respondents (n=1275) | 5.7 | 4.2 | 15.4 | 33.6 | 41.4 |
| Faculty/Educational Administrator (n=213) | 3.3 | 1.4 | 12.7 | 30.0 | 52.6 |
| Administrator (n=222) | 1.4 | 2.3 | 7.2 | 31.1 | 58.1 |
| CRNA (n=328) | 10.1 | 6.1 | 21.0 | 38.1 | 24.7 |
| Nurse Practitioner (n=428) | 6.3 | 5.4 | 18.2 | 32.9 | 37.1 |
| Policy Setting | | | | | |
| All respondents (n=1260) | 12.8 | 12.5 | 27.1 | 30.0 | 17.6 |
| Faculty/Educational Administrator (n=211) | 8.5 | 9.5 | 26.5 | 29.4 | 26.1 |
| Administrator (n=220) | 8.6 | 6.4 | 23.6 | 37.3 | 24.1 |
| CRNA (n=324) | 15.4 | 16.7 | 29.9 | 26.5 | 11.4 |
| Nurse Practitioner (n=421) | 15.7 | 14.0 | 27.3 | 27.3 | 15.7 |

After Graduation

- ▶ 72% never participated in any local, state or federal policy change
- ▶ 85% never led any local state or federal policy change
- ▶ 47% never led nor participated in QI projects
- ▶ 43% never led nor participated in an organizational change project

Reported Roles in Selected Activities after DNP Graduation by Position (1 of 4)

| | Position % | | | | |
|---|---|--------------------------|-----------------|-------------------------------|-----------------|
| | Faculty/Educational Administrator (n=216) | Administrator (n=226) | CRNA (n=335) | Nurse Practitioner (n=435) | All (n=1308) |
| Roles | | | | | |
| <u>Starting an APRN Clinic</u> | | | | | |
| Participant | 8.8 | 3.1 | 1.2 | 6.4 | 4.8 |
| Leader | 11.6 | 4.4 | 0.3 | 12.0 | 7.6 |
| <u>QI Design and Implementation Project</u> | | | | | |
| Participant | 28.2 | 19.0 | 19.7 | 22.3 | 21.9 |
| Leader | 30.1 | 74.8 | 17.6 | 23.0 | 33.0 |

Reported Roles in Selected Activities after DNP Graduation by Position (2 of 4)

| | Position % | | | | |
|------------------------------------|---|--------------------------|-----------------|-------------------------------|-----------------|
| Roles | Faculty/Educational Administrator (n=216) | Administrator (n=226) | CRNA (n=335) | Nurse Practitioner (n=435) | All (n=1308) |
| <u>Organization Change Project</u> | | | | | |
| Participant | 23.6 | 10.2 | 23.3 | 25.1 | 21.5 |
| Leader | 35.6 | 88.5 | 19.7 | 25.3 | 37.8 |

Reported Roles in Selected Activities after DNP Graduation by Position (3 of 4)

| | Position % | | | | |
|----------------------------|---|-----------------------|--------------|----------------------------|--------------|
| | Faculty/Educational Administrator (n=216) | Administrator (n=226) | CRNA (n=335) | Nurse Practitioner (n=435) | All (n=1308) |
| <u>Roles</u> | | | | | |
| <u>Local Policy Change</u> | | | | | |
| Participant | 25.0 | 29.2 | 14.9 | 16.3 | 19.4 |
| Leader | 12.5 | 25.2 | 9.0 | 7.1 | 12.0 |
| <u>State Policy Change</u> | | | | | |
| Participant | 26.4 | 28.3 | 11.0 | 16.3 | 18.7 |
| Leader | 7.9 | 8.8 | 6.3 | 3.9 | 6.1 |
| Leader | 16.2 | 7.1 | 2.1 | 3.7 | 6.1 |

Reported Roles in Selected Activities after DNP Graduation by Position (4 of 4)

| | Position % | | | | |
|--|---|-----------------------|--------------|----------------------------|--------------|
| | Faculty/Educational Administrator (n=216) | Administrator (n=226) | CRNA (n=335) | Nurse Practitioner (n=435) | All (n=1308) |
| <u>Roles</u> | | | | | |
| <u>Externally Funded Research</u> | | | | | |
| <u>Grant</u> | | | | | |
| Participant | 21.8 | 19.9 | 3.9 | 6.2 | 11.2 |
| Leader | 12.0 | 8.0 | 2.4 | 2.5 | 5.3 |
| <u>Federal or International Policy</u> | | | | | |
| <u>Change</u> | | | | | |
| Participant | 13.4 | 10.2 | 5.4 | 6.4 | 7.7 |
| Leader | 2.8 | 3.5 | 0.9 | 1.4 | 1.8 |
| <u>Educational/Training Grant</u> | | | | | |
| Participant | 25.0 | 18.1 | 4.8 | 7.6 | 12.1 |
| Leader | 16.2 | 7.1 | 2.1 | 3.7 | 6.1 |



Employment Changes and Reported Degree Effect on Obtaining/Keeping Position by Position (n=1210) (1 of 2)

| | Position % | | | |
|---|---------------------------------------|---------------|-------|--------------------|
| | Faculty/ Educational Administrator | Administrator | CRNA | Nurse Practitioner |
| Position & Employment Changes Between Entering DNP and Survey Completion | n=209 | n=214 | n=321 | n=415 |
| Same Employment Setting/Same Position | 19.6 | 36.4 | 43.3 | 36.6 |
| Different Employment Setting/Same Position | 5.3 | 5.6 | 14.0 | 14.2 |
| Different Employment Setting/Different Position | 52.6 | 33.6 | 26.2 | 38.6 |
| Same Employment Setting/Different Position | 22.5 | 24.3 | 15.9 | 9.4 |
| Did not work before DNP | - | - | 0.6 | 1.2 |

Employment Changes and Reported Degree Effect on Obtaining/Keeping Position by Position (n=1210) (2 of 2)

| | Position % | | | |
|--|------------------------------------|---------------|-------|--------------------|
| | Faculty/ Educational Administrator | Administrator | CRNA | Nurse Practitioner |
| DNP Effect on Ability to Get/Keep Current Position | n=213 | n=221 | n=331 | n=425 |
| None, Not Required nor Preferred | 12.7 | 51.1 | 76.4 | 76.5 |
| Not Required but Preferred | 24.9 | 37.1 | 13.0 | 17.9 |
| Required | 62.4 | 11.8 | 10.6 | 5.6 |

Greatest Personal Contribution of DNP Degree by Position (n=1052)

| Title | % Indicating Contribution | | | | | | | |
|--|---------------------------|-------------|----------|---------------|-------------|----------------|-------------------------|-------|
| | Personal | Job Options | Prestige | Do Job Better | Do Research | Specific Skill | Nothing/ Detrimental | Other |
| Faculty/Educational Administrator (n=189) | 7.9 | 30.2 | 10.6 | 0.5 | 1.6 | 48.1 | 0.5 | 0.5 |
| Administrator (n=179) | 8.9 | 17.4 | 21.2 | 0.6 | 0.6 | 49.7 | 0.0 | 1.7 |
| CRNA (n=263) | 11.4 | 22.8 | 12.6 | 1.5 | 0.4 | 40.7 | 8.7 | 1.9 |
| Nurse Practitioner (n=345) | 17.1 | 13.3 | 14.2 | 1.2 | 1.7 | 45.3 | 6.3 | 0.9 |
| All (n=1052) | 12.7 | 19.8 | 14.8 | 1.0 | 1.1 | 44.7 | 4.7 | 1.3 |

Effects of Age, Time Since Degree

Limitations

- ▶ Not inclusive of all organizations
- ▶ Perhaps overestimates favorably (organizational membership)
- ▶ No comparison with those who did not get DNP and hold similar positions

Implications

- ▶ Preparation for today and tomorrow's work force
- ▶ Expense: Benefit ratio
- ▶ Organizational effects
 - Inter
 - Intra

Time: From Training to Use (If Ever)

Potential Gap Between Leadership and Membership

Potential Differentiation in Views Among Nursing Organizations



Next Steps

Questions and Reactions

References

- ▶ Carter, M. A., & Jones, M. (2017). Nationwide doctor of nursing practice/advanced practice registered nurse survey on roles, functions, and competencies. *Journal of Doctoral Nursing Practice*, 10(2), 108-112. doi: 10.1891/2380-9418.10.2.108
- ▶ Christiansen, B., & Champion, J. D. (2018). Examining doctor of nursing practice clinical competency. *The Journal for Nurse Practitioners*, 14(5), e93-e100. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.nurpra.2018.02.006>
- ▶ Mancuso, J. M., Udlis, K. A., & Anbari, A. B. (2017). Comments surrounding the doctor of nursing practice (DNP): Stress, ambiguity, and strain. *Journal of Nursing Education & Practice*, 7(4), 76-86. doi: 10.5430/jnep.v7n4p76
- ▶ Minnick, A. F., Norman, L. D., & Donaghey, B. (2013). Defining and describing capacity issues in U.S. Doctor of nursing practice programs. *Nursing Outlook*, 61(2), 93-101. doi: 10.1016/j.outlook.2012.07.011
- ▶ National Organization of Nurse Practitioner Faculties. (2017). The doctor of nursing practice summit - proceedings. Washington: National Organization of Nurse Practitioner Faculties.
- ▶ Udlis, K. A., & Mancuso, J. M. (2015). Perceptions of the role of the doctor of nursing practice-prepared nurse: Clarity or confusion. *Journal of Professional Nursing*, 31(4), 274-283. doi: 10.1016/j.profnurs.2015.01.004